A Protocol for Development of Holistic-Entrepreneur Graduates: Emotional Intelligence Perspectives

Nurul Haerani Mohamad¹*, Badaruddin Ibrahim¹, Asri Selamat¹, Affero Ismail¹, Zulida Abdul Kadir²

¹Faculty of Technical and Vocational Education, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia, 86400 Parit Raja, Batu Pahat, Johor, MALAYSIA
²Department of English Language and Linguistics, Centre for Language Studies, Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia, 86400 Parit Raja, Batu Pahat, Johor, MALAYSIA

*Corresponding Author

DOI: https://doi.org/10.30880/jtet.2021.13.01.004
Received 15th January 2021; Accepted 15th February 2021; Available online 31st March 2021

Abstract: Entrepreneurship is seen as a potential career path for overcoming the problem of unemployment among TVET graduates especially during this Covid-19 outbreaks. However, this career has yet to get a second or even a last option TVET graduates in Malaysia. Various efforts have been undertaken by the stakeholders through the first surge of the Malaysia Education Blueprint 2015-2025 (Higher Education) and the continuation of the implementation of the Entrepreneurship Action Plan 2016-2020, the holistic development of human capital and entrepreneurial backbone graduate entrepreneurs in targeted delivery. However, based on current achievements, this is not easy to be implemented as the desire of entrepreneurship is not incredibly encouraging, especially graduates in technical and vocational courses. Therefore, this study was conducted to explore emotional intelligence attributes needed by TVET graduates to become a qualified graduated Holistic-Entrepreneur. This study was conducted qualitatively involved three phases. The first phase: data acquisition qualitatively based on document analysis; second phase: focus group discussion and, third phase: experts’ interview. The participants involved are from Ministry of Education and MTUN lecturers and they are expert in students’ development and entrepreneurship. The result shows there are six attributes of emotional intelligence needed by TVET graduates to become a holistic entrepreneur graduates. The implication of the proposed as guideline for relevant parties and TVET graduates in increasing student minded and desire towards entrepreneurship

Keywords: Holistic-entrepreneur, TVET, student development, emotional intelligence

1. Introduction

The 2019 coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic is a new tragedy in human civilisation. It was first identified in November 2019 in Wuhan China and spread rapidly, resulting in an ongoing global pandemic (Hui et al., 2020). Malaysia introduced several phases of movement control orders or lockdown starting from 18–31 March, followed by 1–14 April, 15–28 April, 29 April–11 May 2020, 12 May–9 June and the latest is from 12 May – 31 August 2020. Since the introduction of lockdown, people are required to restrict their activities by working from home (WFH) and almost all economic sectors were closed excepts for essential services such as food, healthcare, water; energy, security and defence, solid waste and public cleansing, communication, banking and finance and e-commerce and logistics (Kamaruddin et al., 2020). As COVID-19 restrict the activities by working from home (WFH) and almost all economic
sectors were closed except for essential services (Aday & Aday, 2020). Due to this restriction, it affects the economy as well. Although there has been an increase in the tendency and desire of TVET graduates to choose the field of entrepreneurship in recent times, but the number of those who venture into entrepreneurial careers is still less encouraging (Mathosa, 2018; Ibrahim & Bakar, 2015). Based on the 2020 Graduate Tracking Study, the Ministry of Higher Education showed that a total of 25, 888, 2019 graduates stated that they are self-employed, representing 13.7 percent of the total graduates who are working. Furthermore, the consistent increase in the number of higher education institutions technical graduates who enter the field of entrepreneurship immediately after graduation is still very small which is only about 2% of the total number of those who graduate each year (Entrepreneurship Action Plan for Higher Education Institutions, 2016-2020). This phenomenon may limit the tendency and desire of young people especially among TVET graduates to venture into entrepreneurship as a career.

A study conducted by Garrett, Saloner, Nohria and Hubbard (2016) also found that graduates are less involved in entrepreneurship as a career of choice because most graduates do not see the business opportunities offered in entrepreneurship as a profession that can guarantee their future. The study, which is carried out by out by Tiwari, Bhat and Tikoria (2017) states the entrepreneurial intentions as the result of emotional intelligence. Liguori et al., (2020), Ojiaku et al., (2018) and Elfving, Brännback and Carsrud (2017) have presented the model of entrepreneurial intentions, which are assessed by the affecting behavior of individual. This is useful while realizing the choice of students’ career, where it is related to the behavior own business organization (Liguori et al., (2020)). Liguori et al., (2020) mention that emotional components are expressed by feelings and emotions, determining attitude toward own entrepreneurial intentions. Components of recognition have a linkage to trust and thinking, and forming attitudes towards business establishment. Individuals, having high self-efficiency of emotional intelligence, demonstrate high immunity to stress and stressors of environment (Aderibigbe, 2017). The mentioned tendency of self-awareness has a practical meaning related to attitudes of business initiation. Individuals, having high emotional self-efficiency develop more positive attitudes towards their own business establishment.

Furthermore, Kohr et al., (2020) and Mohamad et al., (2019) stated that a good emotional control leads to mental health which contributes to changes in behavior and interest in career. Poor mental health will have a direct impact on physical health. Relate this sentence with emotional intelligence factors in this research context; e.g self-awareness, motivation Therefore, in order to realize the government’s intention in producing entrepreneurial graduates, students should know how to handle emotions, especially when they are facing with ambiguity and failure because a career as an entrepreneur is often faced with ambiguity and failure due to changes in human relations (MOE, 2017). Therefore this study was carry out based on following objectives:

i) Exploring the attributes of emotional intelligence needed by students in enhancing entrepreneurial desires towards the holistic entrepreneurship students’ development.

ii) Determine the attributes of emotional intelligence needed by students in enhancing entrepreneurial desires towards the holistic entrepreneurship students’ development.

2.1 Emotional Intelligence and Personal Features in Developing Holistic-Entrepreneurship

Mayer and Salovey (1993) were the first to present academically about their discoveries in the field of emotional intelligence. They define emotional intelligence as the intelligence of social intelligences’ type that involves the ability to control the emotions of self and others, be able to distinguish between types of emotions and use information to guide one’s thoughts and actions. According to them, emotional intelligence can be categorized into five specifics that are domains, namely self-awareness, emotional control, motivation, empathy and interpersonal skills. Mayer and Solovey (1997) further refine the definition of emotional intelligence as “the ability to detect emotions, to enter and create emotions to aid thinking, to understand emotions and acquire emotional knowledge, always thinking to control emotions to foster emotional and intellectual development”. They have a combination of ideas i.e. Emotions make intelligent thinking and intelligent thinking about emotions.

Still it is not clear how do personal features of individuals affect entrepreneurial intentions within emotional intelligence. Active discussions emerge regarding the influence of emotional intelligence to the individuals’ success. Below are the two possible tendencies:

- Radical, which is represented by Rodrigues et al., (2019), who state that emotional intelligence perform a main role for success in both life and business; and
- Restrainted, represented by Xie, Lv and Xu (2018), whom do not absolute the importance of emotional intelligence for an individual success.

In the context of education in Malaysia, the aspect of emotional intelligence is also set as a goal in the National Education Philosophy to produce a balanced human being in terms of intellectual, spiritual, emotional and physical. Recognizing fact, the elements of emotional intelligence are inserted directly into several subjects such as moral education, ethics education, professionalism, statehood and civilization. In fact, this aspect is also applied across the curriculum in the hope that the importance of emotional intelligence is allocated at the same level as intellectual
intelligence. According to Goleman (1995), emotional intelligence can be measured through an ‘emotional test’, comprising five elements: namely self-awareness, social skills, emotional management, empathy and self-monitoring. Although the importance of personal characteristics is already analyzed in entrepreneurship literature, correlating personal characteristics, emotional intelligence and entrepreneurial intentions a theoretical model, linking the mentioned factors was not drawn. Self-efficiency of an individual has a significant influence to individual’s tendency to risk (Ferreira et al., 2012). By discovering new possibilities, an individual may control risk within his/her competences (Pérez-López, et al., 2016). Individuals’ intentions and actions include the contour of faith and desires (Jarvis, 2016). Other authors, who are studying entrepreneurship (Bazan et al., 2020; Rai et al., 2017; Tran and Von Korflesch, 2016) similarly form two factors affecting business organization intentions, desirability and feasibility. Desirability is defined as a desire of individual to go beyond internal barriers of a person while establishing own business. Internal barriers are related to individual’s desire to minimize the shortage of imagination, personal desire (Hoogendoorn et al., 2019). Feasibility amplifies personal and subject features. Salajagheh et al., (2014) associates’ feasibility to self-efficiency of an individual, and this factor is related to emotional intelligence. This fact allows personal characteristics of individual link to business organization intentions within the emotional intelligence. A theoretical analysis was carried out to allow in designing a model of business organization intentions, which is supplemented by factors of personal features and emotional intelligence. Personal features of individual in the model are need of achievement, tendency to risk, internal control and self-confidence. It is then relating to proactivity and creativity within emotional self-efficiency. Structure of the model is presented in Figure 2. Business establishment act is related to tendency to risk, needs of achievement and independence (Karabulut, 2016). Tolerance of risk, achievements, and independence, enlarges the possibility that an individual will take the risk to establish his/her own business organization. Accent of entrepreneurship must transform from short-term courses promoting entrepreneurship towards formation of potential ratio to become an entrepreneur.

3. Methodology

This qualitative study was using case study design approach to provide a comprehensive overview of the holistic-entrepreneur focuses on emotional intelligence construct and attributes. This study was conducted through three phases namely; i) Phase I - Document Analysis; ii) Phase ii – Focus group Discussion; iii) Phase iii – Interview.

3.1 Phase I - Document Analysis

At the initial stage of the study, the researcher has identified the issue to be studied based on the literature review that is appropriate to the study conducted. Next, this study was formulated in accordance with the problems that have been identified and the research proposal paper was written and presented to the panel members who have been appointed. After that improvements were made to the proposal paper as recommended by the panel of evaluators. At this phase, a comprehensive document analysis literature analysis was carried out to point out all the constructs and attributes to develop the conceptual framework, focusses on emotional intelligent for TVET graduates Malaysia. The document
analysis was based on lecture series, book, and previous studies on the association of holistic students’ development, entrepreneurship and emotional intelligent. The method used in literature analysis is thematic analysis and all the data retrieved, and analysis based on frequency.

3.2 Phase II – Focus Group Discussion

At this phase, researcher has organized a workshop involving ten experts and the criteria of the experts are determined based on the field of expertise including students’ development, human capital, entrepreneurship, and co-curriculum with experience in institutions under the Ministry of Education Malaysia (MOE) for at least 5 years. They are also recognized by colleagues or academic members as successful practitioners in their respective fields (Swanson & Falkman, 1997). Furthermore, at this phase, the experts’ consensus was obtained using the Fuzzy Delphi Method (FDM) approach introduced by Murray, Pipino and Gigch (1985) and reviewed by Kaufman and Gupta (1988). Through this study, FDM procedures in the qualitative approach were used because FDM is the most appropriate method to achieve the objectives of the study. Through this workshop, emotional intelligence constructs and attributes were obtained and then were analyzed using Fuzzy Delphi Method (FDM). The workshop conducted involved 10 experts from various field including student development and entrepreneurship for 30 hours brainstorming session.

3.1 Phase II – Interview

Next, at this stage, the researcher has conducted an interview with six experts who were appointed by the researcher as referred to the field of students’ student development, human capital, entrepreneurship, and co-curriculum with experience in institutions of higher learning for at least five years and also recognized by colleagues or academics as successful practitioners in their respective fields (Swanson & Falkman, 1997). Then, the interview results were analyzed based on the themes and used pencil and paper techniques to obtain the emotional intelligent attributes needed by TVET graduates. After that, the results of the analysis obtained was analysed based on Fuzzy Delphi method (FDM) to get the experts’ agreement on the emotional intelligent attributes.

4. Result

4.1 Phase I - Document Analysis

A summary of matrix analysis related to emotional intelligence attributes is explained in Table 1. Previous studies that have been conducted by local and foreign researchers are used by researchers as a guide to identify the emotional attributes needed by graduates and prospective graduates in moulding them with entrepreneurial characteristics. Among the studies related to emotional intelligence attributes are studies by Higgs and Dulewicz (2000), Garner (2006), Golemen (1995), Sabran et al. (2010), Carson and Birkenmeier (1999) and amsah and Zakaria (2008).

Therefore, emotional control is a very important factor in educating individuals before entering the world of work. Usually the emotional effects will disturb and cause a lot of negative problems in individuals’ daily life. As a result, the individual will not have good self-management (Sabran et al., 2010). Therefore, latent emotions should be expressed before interfering with the sanity of thoughts and actions. Esa et al., (2015) suggested that student involvement through co-curricular activities can help them in stress management by performing physical and mental activities. For example, through the University Community Engagement (UCE) project, students are encouraged to find sources of capital through sponsorship. They are advised to meet with political and corporate figures to apply sponsorship. In this case, the emotions of the students are trained to manage their discomfort properly, not to be disappointed when they face failure. Therefore, student’s involvement through co-curriculum is indirectly a platform in producing students who are holistic and have entrepreneurial characteristics. Overall, the emotional attributes required by students through document analysis are self-awareness, self-control, self-motivation, empathy, social skills, assertiveness, and prudence, integrity, and interpersonal skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emotional Intelligence Attributes</th>
<th>Previous Models and Studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Self-awareness</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Self-control</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Self-motivation</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Empathy</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Social Skills</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1 Focus Group Discussion

Tables 2 shows the values and results of the analysis using the Fuzzy Delphi Method (FDM) for emotional intelligence attributes based on consensus of the experts during the workshop organized. According to Mohd Jamil et al., (2017), the measurement of these findings is interpreted through three conditions. The first condition where the threshold value must be equal to or more than 0.2 ($d \leq 0.2$). Second, involves the percentage value of experts either equal or more than 75% ($\text{Expert consensus} \geq 75\%$). Lastly, the fuzzy score value must be equal to or more than 0.5 ($\text{fuzzy score} \geq 0.5$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Emotional Intelligence Attributes</th>
<th>Triangular Fuzzy Numbers</th>
<th>Defuzzification process</th>
<th>Expert consensus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Threshold Value, d</td>
<td>Expert consensus percentage, %</td>
<td>Fuzzy Score (A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Self-control</td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Self-motivation</td>
<td>0.147</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>0.183</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Social Skills</td>
<td>0.153</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>0.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Firmness and Prudence</td>
<td>0.237</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>0.313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>0.183</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>0.513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Interpersonal Skills</td>
<td>0.171</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>0.720</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 2, “Firmness and Prudence” should be omitted from the list of attributes as it failed to fulfill the conditions of FDM measurement

4.3 Interview with the Experts

Table 3 shows results of the interview results based on five experts who have extensive experience in the field of study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Interview Quotes</th>
<th>Attribute</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1T1</td>
<td>I think self-attributes in terms of sensitivity are important right.. Self-awareness... it means that students need to be sensitive that in this country we no longer give jobs, they have to create jobs...</td>
<td>Self-awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P1T2</td>
<td>This social skill is important because when we want to deal with people, we have to be good at interpreting the character, of an individual.. other people will behave..haha .. then when we face this person, we have to be good at controlling our emotions.. especially when nk be this entrepreneur .. we need to be good at controlling ourselves so that later when we want to deal with this customer we can not be forced to buy our goods or services ye ..</td>
<td>Social skill Self-control</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Emotions do play an important role in any situation and situation, I will look at emotions first you can control yourself emotionally these emotions refer to our inner motivation...

.. then interpersonal skills and also you have social skills also play an important role because when you want to be an entrepreneur, we get to hang out a lot and meet people we have to work a lot with outsiders to succeed in business to a higher level..

.. you control the emotion when you become emotionally, and you will become irrational so you have to control well yourself...

.. then the ability to react to any situation is also important here's come your interpersonal skills you react according to the others emotions based in the situation do not let him be sad you laugh so the ability to react with Other people's emotions are very important..

.. you need to know yourself well you have to control your emotion...

.. for example if in the context of this entrepreneurship you always face the risk because if your emotions can not balance because of this risk it will lead you to a rather critical feeling if you can not control him right For example the first time you do this you fail what is the preparation for you for you to take to the next level...

The results of the interview analysis found that all experts stated that “Self-awareness” is the vital trait that the students should possess in becoming holistic and entrepreneurial graduates. Based on the interviews, all experts are almost in line with the findings obtained through the analysis of documents obtained from previous models and studies and researchers.

5. Discussion and Conclusion

In a nutshell, there are six attributes of emotional intelligence that have been acquired and all these attributes have been arranged accordingly to the rank based on based on the FDM analysis. These emotional attributes are (i) self-control, (ii) self-awareness, (iii) self-motivation, (iv) interpersonal skills, (v) empathy (vi) and (vii) social skills. The findings of this study also show that the attributes of self-control are placed on the first ranking in the emotional construct and the results are in line with the findings of Nadzri, Shamsudin and Sabri (2014), where self-control factors play the most important role in defending business enterprises. Self-control attributes are related to how an individual is able to manage his/her emotions based on circumstances, pressures and internal resources (Sabran et al., 2010). With regard to the attributes of self-control, majority of experts interviewed agreed that these attributes are very important in producing the holistic-entrepreneur TVET graduates. These findings are also clearly show that this attribute is very important to be embedded into TVET students because awareness of this attribute will be able to produce students to be productive and patient employees.

Meanwhile, according to Rundle et al., (2019) employers desperately need employees who have basic self-control because it can benefit the company or organization in reducing the rate of self-stress while working and can indirectly increase the productivity of the company. Tunggak and Ahmed (2015) in their study also found that self-control factor is a factor that contributes to the orientation of entrepreneurial attitude in maintaining the entrepreneurship performance. Ab Ghani and Sarif (2009) argue that self-awareness is vital in producing a responsibility entrepreneur addition, Othman and Ishak (2011) also argue that to be an entrepreneur, ones should observe himself and be empathy with the surroundings. Entrepreneur should first observe themselves and know the feelings of other individuals around them. According to Yusof (2000), self-motivation is one of the basic characteristics of entrepreneurship. According to him, self-motivation is the driving force that will differentiate between potential and half-baked entrepreneur. An explanation of self-motivation is largely related to the hierarchical needs by Maslow (1954), the theory of the need for success McClelland (1998) and the theory of achievement expectations by Vroom (1988). All these theories explain that the needs and goals of individuals are different but the pressure towards achieving it will be stronger when an individual sees the results and actions are able to meet his needs. Based on Chickering and Reisser (1993), through interpersonal skills, students are trained to create communication networks, friends or allies from different walks of life to cultivate their maturity in facing the realities of future life based on exposure to various cultures, races, religions and background.

40
as well as strengthening ties with people around. Syadzali and Ridwan (2016) think that these interpersonal skills are related to the quality of relationships between students’ circles of friends and people around them. However, over dominance or over reliance should be avoided but needs a balance between the two. Therefore, it can be seen the importance of this attribute in creating job opportunities.

Mohamad et al., (2019) mention that empathy is a human skills where a person shares value and compassion with other people. To achieve this level of holistic graduate entrepreneurial character, the attribute of empathy needs to be embedded in an individual needs to possess teamwork skills in order to work well in a team. Finally, this study found that social skills is the final element of emotional intelligence. Sabran et al., (2010) stated that communication skills is social skills in emotion and can help others to manage their emotions and have the ability to help others to manage their emotions. For example, when a student experiences emotional stress, the student needs to share the problem with others.

Overall, the results of the qualitative analysis show that there are six important attributes that need to be mastered by TVET students in order to be a well holistic-entrepreneur. They are self-control, self-awareness self-control, self-awareness, self-motivation, interpersonal skills, empathy and social skills. Therefore, it is important for a TVET student to realize the importance of these emotional intelligence attributes and master all these attributes in achieving the holistic and entrepreneurial TVET graduate status.

Acknowledgement

The authors would like to thank Ministry of Education Malaysia (MOE) for funding this research. The support given by MOE under UTHM Contract Grant U940 for providing the facilities to perform this research is highly appreciated.

References


Aderibigbe, J. K. (2017). Psychological Capital and Emotional Intelligence as Moderators of the Relationship Between Occupational Stress and Organisational Citizenship Behaviour Among Graduate Employees in Nigeria (Doctoral dissertation, University of Fort Hare)


Pérez-López, M. C., González-López, M. J., & Rodríguez-Ariza, L. (2016). Competencies for entrepreneurship as a career option in a challenging employment environment. *Career Development International*


Zulvia, Y. F. (2020). The Impact of Core Values, Character and Entrepreneur Leadership in Successful Of Minangkabau Leaders And Javanese Leaders. *Jurnal Ilmiah Poli Bisnis, 12*(1), 14-26